

AGENDA

Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

Date: Wednesday, January 26, 2005
Time: 1:30 p.m. (EST)
Location: Conference Room A
Indiana Government Conference Center
402 W. Washington Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Call to Order

Approval of the October 21, 2004 meeting's minutes

I. Division Director's Report

II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the Sowers Bank Barn at the Gene Stratton Porter State Historic Site, Noble County, Indiana.
2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter Turkey Run Inn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.
3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Tennis Court Shelterhouse, Big Log Shelterhouse, Middle Shelterhouse, and Newby Gulch Shelterhouse at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.
4. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Saddle Barn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.
5. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Apple House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.
6. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Orchard House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.
7. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Greenhouse at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.
8. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Salt Barn at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

9. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Milk House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

III. Emergency Action Using State Funds

1. Stabilization of the Posey House at the Corydon Capitol State Historic Site, Harrison County, Indiana.

IV. National Register Applications

1. Bell Ford Post Patented Diagonal "Combination Bridge", 071-581-30009, SR 258 1.5 miles West junction SR 258 and Community Drive, Seymour vic., Jackson County, IN (1579)
2. Cataract Covered Bridge, At the intersection of CR 235W and CR1000N over Mill Creek in Leiber State Recreation Area, Cataract vic., Owen County (1657)
3. Charles Sweeton House, 163-195-15028, 8700 Old State Road, Evansville, Vanderburgh County (1786)
4. Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)
5. Vinegar Hill Historic District, 105-055-77000, both sides of E. 1st St. from Woodlawn to Jordan and S. Sheridan to E. Maxwell, Bloomington, Monroe County (1801)
6. Patoka Bridges Historic District, CR 300W from the Gibson-Pike County line and Bridge #246 over the Patoka River South Fork to the northern abutment of Bridge #81 over Houchins Ditch, Oakland City vic., Pike County (1803)
7. Twelve Points Historic District, 167-628-24001-24026, Lafayette Ave from Linden to 13th St & Maple Ave from Garfield to 13th St., Terre Haute, Vigo County (1804)
8. Dr. Christopher Souder House, 183-510-16028, 214 W. Main Street, Larwill, Whitley County (1809)

V. Grant Applications for FY2005

1. Consideration of Architectural / Historical applications
2. Consideration of Archaeological applications
3. Consideration of Acquisition and Development applications

VI. Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

Listed

Jonas Votaw House, 075-521-33100, 1525 S. Meridian Street, Portland, Jay County (1750)
John Keip House, 017-366-70661, 2500 East Broadway, Logansport, Cass County (1757)
Victory Noll-St. Felix Friary Historic District, 069—49-23007-23020, 1900 W. Park Dr./1280
Hitzfield St. Huntington, Huntington County (1784)

Joseph J. Bingham Indianapolis Public School #84, 097-296-22010, 440 East 57th Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1788)
Wheeler-Stokely Mansion, 097-296-55005, 3200 Cold Springs Rd., Indianapolis, Marion County (1789)
Ralph Waldo Emerson Indianapolis Public School #58, 098-295-02188, 321 Linwood Ave., Indianapolis, Marion County (1791)
Brendonwood Historic District, 097-295-02000, roughly bounded by Fall Creek, 56th Street, and Brendon Forest Drive, Indianapolis, Marion County (1794)
Richwood Evangelical Lutheran Church, 035-618-55034, 9700 West CR 700 S, Middletown, Delaware County (1795)
Fowler Theater, 111 East Fifth St., Fowler, Benton County (1797)
Irene Byron Tuberculosis Sanatorium – Physician’s Residences, 003-286-17013 and 17014, Allen County (1802)
Alexander T. Rankin House, 818 S. Lafayette St., Fort Wayne, Allen County (1805)

VII. Set date for the next meeting

Proposed date: April 27, 2005 , Conference Room A, Indiana Government Conference Center, 1:30 p.m. (EST)

TO: Members of the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

FROM: Jon Smith, Director, Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology

DATE: January 5, 2005

SUBJECT: Staff comments for items on the January 26, 2005 Agenda

II. State Certificates of Approval

- 1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the Sowers Bank Barn at the Gene Stratton Porter State Historic Site, Noble County, Indiana.**

The comment for this agenda item, if necessary, will be mailed separately.

- 2. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter Turkey Run Inn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.**

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.2. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Turkey Run State Park which, in part, lies within Penn, Sugar Creek, and Howard townships was identified in the Parke County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #121-659-00201. The Turkey Run Inn is one of many buildings and structures in the park, and formerly the members of the Historic Preservation Review Board ("Board") concluded that given the historical and architectural significance of the Turkey Run Inn, it is considered to be historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because an historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes peeling back modern fiberglass shingles, replacement of deteriorated materials in each valley, and reinstallation of the fiberglass shingles. The existing roof is not original and the proposed replacement will neither significantly modify the historic character of Turkey Run Inn nor diminish any character-defining features; therefore, the DHPA staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.2 as its findings.

- 3. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Tennis Court Shelterhouse, Big Log Shelterhouse, Middle Shelterhouse, and Newby Gulch Shelterhouse at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.**

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.3. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Turkey Run State Park which, in part, lies within Penn, Sugar Creek, and Howard townships was identified in the Parke County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #121-659-00201. A 1990 survey of Civilian Conservation Corps ("CCC") and Works Progress Administration ("WPA") State Park resources included the Newby Gulch Shelterhouse, the Tennis Court Shelterhouse, the Big Log Shelterhouse, and the Middle Shelterhouse and assigned an "N" - Notable rating. All of these resources have good architectural integrity and are significant for their association with New Deal agency work within Turkey Run State Park. As such, we believe that the Newby Gulch Shelterhouse, the Tennis Court Shelterhouse, the Big Log Shelterhouse, and the Middle Shelterhouse are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because historic structures owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes the replacement of deteriorated firebrick. As the Division of State Parks and Reservoirs proposes to replace the deteriorated firebrick with in-kind materials and match the new mortar to the existing mortar in width and profile, the DHPA staff has no concerns or recommendations regarding the scope of work as currently proposed.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.3 as its findings.

4. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs for a certificate of approval to alter the Saddle Barn at Turkey Run State Park, Penn Township, Parke County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.4. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Sue Becher Gilliam, Historic Preservation Consultant on behalf of the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of State Parks and Reservoirs.

The Turkey Run State Park which, in part, lies within Penn, Sugar Creek, and Howard townships was identified in the Parke County Interim Report, Indiana Survey of Historic Sites and Structures, and for the purposes of that survey, it was assigned site #121-659-00201. A 1990 survey of Civilian Conservation Corps ("CCC") and Works Progress Administration ("WPA") State Park resources included the Saddle Barn and assigned it an "N" - Notable rating. The Saddle Barn has good architectural integrity and is significant for association with New Deal agency work within Turkey Run State Park. As such, we believe that the Saddle Barn is historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

Because an historic structure owned by the state will be altered by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the state, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The scope of work includes 1) upgrading the electrical service, 2) upgrading the employee restroom, 3) repair of damaged windows, 4) repair of damaged board and batten doors and siding, 5) low pressure power washing of the stable area, 6) scrape, prime, and repaint the interior and exterior, 7) repair asphalt walkway in stable area, 8) apply new asphalt to the sidewalk and parking lot, 9) install a floor

level barrier along the sides of the balustrade, 10) repair the brick patio at the door, and 11) remove and replace the paddock's gravel bedding.

For the most part, the DHPA staff considers the scope of work as currently proposed to be acceptable. However, the DHPA staff has some observations and suggestions:

- It is unclear how many windows need repairs. Additionally, it is unclear how the windows will be repaired so that they fit and operate properly. The DHPA staff recommends that the Division of State Museum and Historic Sites follow the recommended approaches in the National Park Service's *Preservation Brief #9: The Repair of Historic Wooden Windows*.
- We have noted the Division of State Museum and Historic Sites proposes to use a low pressure power wash to clean the stable area. The DHPA staff recommends removing the damaged and deteriorated paint to the next sound layer using the gentlest means possible (i.e., handscraping and handsanding), so that the historic woodwork is not irreversibly damaged.

Based upon the scope of work provided, the Board might want to consider the following issues when evaluating this project:

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.4 as its findings.

5. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Apple House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.5 and is a follow-up to the request submitted at the April 28, 2004 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting. During the April meeting, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department of Correction wished to pursue demolition, they provide a detailed description of the structural problems of this building and how it was determined that the building is not structurally sound enough for renovation. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Indiana Department of Correction and one Structure Evaluation Report which includes information on all of the buildings.

The Apple House lies within the larger Indiana Boy's School Historic District. The district was determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on November 4, 1998. The Apple House is one of many structures that contribute to the historic and architectural significance of the district. Therefore, we believe that both the Apple House and the Indiana Boy's School Historic District are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State will be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The DHPA staff remains concerned about the demolition because the photographs and description of the building do not appear to explain sufficiently why the Apple House can not be renovated. Furthermore, it is unclear if cleaning up debris, placement of back fill, regrading and seeding the site is still part of the scope as described in the April 28, 2004 request.

If an adequate rationale is presented at the Review Board meeting to persuade the members of the Board that demolition of the Apple House is acceptable, then at the very least, DHPA staff would

recommend that the historic structure be documented according to the State of Indiana Minimum Architectural Documentation Standards.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.5 as its findings. If a certificate of approval is granted, then the staff recommends that the approval include the condition that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, work will stop and the discovery will be reported to the DHPA within two (2) business days.

6. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Orchard House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.6 and is a follow-up to the request submitted at the April 28, 2004 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting. During the April meeting, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department of Correction wished to pursue demolition, they provide a detailed description of the structural problems of this building and how it was determined that the building is not structurally sound enough for renovation. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Indiana Department of Correction and one Structure Evaluation Report which includes information on all of the buildings.

The Orchard House lies within the larger Indiana Boy's School Historic District. The district was determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on November 4, 1998. The Orchard House is one of many structures that contribute to the historic and architectural significance of the district. Therefore, we believe that both the Orchard House and the Indiana Boy's School Historic District are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State will be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The DHPA staff remains concerned about the demolition because the photographs and description of the building do not appear to explain sufficiently why the Orchard House can not be renovated. Furthermore, it is unclear if cleaning up debris, placement of back fill, regrading and seeding the site is still part of the scope as described in the April 28, 2004 request.

If an adequate rationale is presented at the Review Board meeting to persuade the members of the Board that demolition of the Orchard House is acceptable, then at the very least, DHPA staff would recommend that the historic structure be documented according to the State of Indiana Minimum Architectural Documentation Standards.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.6 as its findings. If a certificate of approval is granted, then the staff recommends that the approval include the condition that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, work will stop and the discovery will be reported to the DHPA within two (2) business days.

7. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Greenhouse at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.7 and is a follow-up to the request submitted at the April 28, 2004 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting. During the April meeting, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department

of Correction wished to pursue demolition, they provide a detailed description of the structural problems of this building and how it was determined that the building is not structurally sound enough for renovation. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Indiana Department of Correction and one Structure Evaluation Report which includes information on all of the buildings.

The Greenhouse lies within the larger Indiana Boy's School Historic District. The district was determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on November 4, 1998. The Greenhouse is one of many structures that contribute to the historic and architectural significance of the district. Therefore, we believe that both the Greenhouse and the Indiana Boy's School Historic District are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State will be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The DHPA staff remains concerned about the demolition but believes that the photographs and description of the building appear to explain sufficiently why the Greenhouse can not be renovated. However, it is unclear if cleaning up debris, placement of back fill, regrading and seeding the site is still part of the scope as described in the April 28, 2004 request.

Assuming the Board is persuaded that the demolition of the Greenhouse is acceptable, then at the very least, DHPA staff would recommend that the historic structure be documented according to the State of Indiana Minimum Architectural Documentation Standards.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.7 as its findings. If a certificate of approval is granted, then the staff recommends that the approval include the condition that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, work will stop and the discovery will be reported to the DHPA within two (2) business days.

8. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Salt Barn at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II.8 and is a follow-up to the request submitted at the April 28, 2004 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting. During the April meeting, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department of Correction wished to pursue demolition, they provide a detailed description of the structural problems of this building and how it was determined that the building is not structurally sound enough for renovation. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Indiana Department of Correction and one Structure Evaluation Report which includes information on all of the buildings.

The Salt Barn lies within the larger Indiana Boy's School Historic District. The district was determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on November 4, 1998. The Salt Barn is one of many structures that contribute to the historic and architectural significance of the district. Therefore, we believe that both the Salt Barn and the Indiana Boy's School Historic District are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State will be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The DHPA staff remains concerned about the demolition but believes that the photographs and description of the building appear to explain sufficiently why the Salt Barn can not be renovated.

However, it is unclear if cleaning up debris, placement of back fill, regrading and seeding the site is still part of the scope as described in the April 28, 2004 request.

Assuming the Board is persuaded that the demolition of the Salt Barn is acceptable, then at the very least, DHPA staff would recommend that the historic structure be documented according to the State of Indiana Minimum Architectural Documentation Standards.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.8 as its findings. If a certificate of approval is granted, then the staff recommends that the approval include the condition that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, work will stop and the discovery will be reported to the DHPA within two (2) business days.

9. Request by the Indiana Department of Correction for a certificate of approval for the demolition of the Milk House at the Juvenile Correction Facility in Plainfield, Hendricks County, Indiana.

The request for a certificate of approval is contained in Attachment II-9 and is a follow-up to the request submitted at the April 28, 2004 Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board meeting. At that time, the Milk House was referred to as the Electric/Paint Shop. During the April meeting, the request was tabled with the Review Board recommendation that if the Indiana Department of Correction wished to pursue demolition, they provide a detailed description of the structural problems of this building and how it was determined that the building is not structurally sound enough for renovation. A completed form was received by the DHPA on December 17, 2004 from the Indiana Department of Correction and one Structure Evaluation Report which includes information on all of the buildings.

The Milk House (Electric/Paint Shop) lies within the larger Indiana Boy's School Historic District. The district was determined eligible for inclusion in the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures on November 4, 1998. The Milk House (Electric/Paint Shop) is one of many structures that contribute to the historic and architectural significance of the district. Therefore, we believe that both the Milk House (Electric/Paint Shop) and the Indiana Boy's School Historic District are historic as that term is used in Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18. Because historic sites or structures owned by the State will be demolished by a project funded, in whole or in part, by the State, a certificate of approval must first be obtained, pursuant to Indiana Code § 14-21-1-18.

The DHPA staff remains concerned about the demolition but believes that the photographs and description of the building appear to explain sufficiently why the Milk House (Electric/Paint Shop) can not be renovated. However, it is unclear if cleaning up debris, placement of back fill, regrading and seeding the site is still part of the scope as described in the April 28, 2004 request.

Assuming the Board is persuaded that the demolition of the Milk House (Electric/Paint Shop) is acceptable, then at the very least, DHPA staff would recommend that the historic structure be documented according to the State of Indiana Minimum Architectural Documentation Standards.

The DHPA staff recommends, in the event the Board takes action on this certificate of approval request, that the Board adopt the staff comments for Agenda Item II.9 as its findings. If a certificate of approval is granted, then the staff recommends that the approval include the condition that if any archaeological artifacts or human remains are uncovered during construction, demolition, or earthmoving activities, work will stop and the discovery will be reported to the DHPA within two (2) business days.

III. Stabilization of the Posey House at the Corydon Capitol State Historic Site, Harrison County, Indiana.

There is no need for comment on this agenda item. A representative from the Division of State Museum and Historic Sites will report on this activity.

IV. National Register Applications

1. Bell Ford Post Patented Diagonal “Combination Bridge”, 071-581-30009, SR 258 1.5 miles West junction SR 258 and Community Drive, Seymour vic., Jackson County, IN (1579)

The application documents the unique engineering heritage of this wood and metal covered bridge and clearly makes a case for its significance. The critical issue for the board is integrity. Several years ago, a wind storm damaged half of the span, sending it tumbling into the White River. Local officials have retrieved heavy timbers and metal fittings to reconstruct this span of the two-span bridge. In consultation with National Park Service-National Register staff, DHPA staff reached the following conclusion: if the remaining span (half) of the bridge still demonstrates the significant engineering and technological traits the bridge as a whole had, it can be eligible for the National Register. Since one span is essentially an independent unit, staff feels that this test is passed by Bell Ford. The National Register staff suggests that DHPA monitor the progress of this project and submit additional photography and information if the other half is rebuilt. The staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, under Criteria A and C. The applicant searched nationally for similar bridges and presents good documentation regarding the national rarity of this bridge; the staff concurs with this property having a national level of significance.

2. Cataract Covered Bridge, At the intersection of CR 235W and CR1000N over Mill Creek in Leiber State Recreation Area, Cataract vic., Owen County (1657)

This wood Smith Truss covered bridge was recently rehabilitated under the guidance of DNR Engineering. The bridge retains a significant amount of its original trusswork and abutments after the rehabilitation. The application describes the bridge, documents its rehabilitation, and explains the significance of its maker (Robert Smith, Smith Bridge Company) and his bridge designs. The staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers with statewide significance, under Criteria A and C.

3. Charles Sweeton House, 163-195-15028, 8700 Old State Road, Evansville, Vanderburgh County (1786)

Rated “notable” in the 1994 Vanderburgh County Interim Report, the Sweeton House is significant both for its association to Charles Sweeton, local entertainment entrepreneur, and as a representation of the country Arts and Crafts house. In comparison with other country houses remaining from before 1945, and other Arts and Crafts houses in Evansville, the Sweeton House stands out for its integrity of setting, and design. The fact that Sweeton “recycled” a schoolhouse to create his country home adds to the local significance of the house. The staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, under Criteria B and C, local significance.

4. Hotel Barton, 501-509 N. Delaware Street, Indianapolis, Marion County (1800)

The board tabled this application in October, 2004 to allow the applicant to research further the significance of the residential hotel as a resource type. This application incorporates that additional information.

The staff continues to have concerns about the eligibility of this property. The National Register criteria require that an eligible resource be an outstanding example of an important property type or architectural style. While the new documentation contributes to the case for the residential hotel as a distinctive type, how representative the Hotel Barton was remains unclear. The staff also remains concerned about whether or not there is sufficient physical integrity to convey significance. Granted the

supposition that the residence hotel was significant to the Indianapolis development scene, the Board must decide if the Barton has sufficient architectural integrity to stand as an outstanding representative of the type. If the Board is uncertain, in order to give the application all benefit of the doubt, the staff suggests approving the application, subject to substantive review by the National Register staff of the National Park Service.

The staff comment for October, 2004 is included below in italics:

This property was rated "contributing" in the 1991 Center Township, Marion County Interim Report. The application asserts that the building is a rare survivor of a once significant property type, the hotel (in particular, the residence hotel). The application includes a thorough description and good photographic documentation of those historic interior elements that do exist, and presents a case for the eligibility of the building. Staff, however, continues to be troubled by several issues regarding the property. The building is missing a key architectural element, its bay windows. In fact, so integral to the building's image are the bay windows, that one pictorial source for the building (Indiana Historical Society) files photos of the Barton Hotel under the heading "bow windows" (sic). If added together in lineal footage, the bay windows comprise about 60% of the total upper exterior walls (11 of 19 vertical bay divisions of the building were bay windows). Additionally, the projecting balconies with paired windows are gone, replaced by windows or smaller windows, and the distinctive Neo-Jacobean balustrade is missing. On the interior, some rooms and elements survive, however, staff (including staff architect) agreed that it was very difficult to tell what configuration the interior had during its prime years as a hotel in about 1925-1930. The most comparable recent situation that might come to mind for the board is Continental Towers (NR, Spink Arms Hotel, also a residence hotel) which retained a minimum of interior integrity, but, did retain its characteristic light wells and bay windows.

The application for the Barton Hotel provides a complete history of the property, and provides a case for its listing. Staff is unsure if the property type "middle price residence hotels" is too narrowly defined; conversely, even with diligent research, the applicant was not able to define physical characteristics of the residence hotel property type that set it aside from other hotels.

Based on the new, additional information, the board needs to decide whether hotel is emblematic of a significant trend, building type, or architectural style, and if so, whether the building has enough integrity as it exists today to still represent that trend or type.

5. Vinegar Hill Historic District, 105-055-77000, both sides of E. 1st St. from Woodlawn to Jordan and S. Sheridan to E. Maxwell, Bloomington, Monroe County (1801)

This district was identified in the 2004 City of Bloomington Interim Report (as well as previous editions of that publication). Additionally, this application was prepared using HPF funds awarded by the Review Board. The City of Bloomington Certified Local Government has approved this application and has forwarded it to our office for final processing. The application documents a significant suburban area of Bloomington with strong ties to Indiana University and the local stone industry. The description includes a lengthy inventory of locally significant landscape objects, many associated with stone mill families, as well as a system to count the resources within the district. This district varies from others in the number of objects as well as the applicant's desire to specifically tally as many of these items as possible. The district meets Criteria A, B and C. Under Criterion A, its association with I.U. faculty and stone industry owners and workers is well documented. The architectural quality of the area under

Criterion C is evident. Under Criterion B, the Park Service will allow a district to qualify, if at least one property would qualify individually under that criterion. More than one property can be listed for one individual under Criterion B. This is important because the Old Crescent Historic District includes Kinsey's offices. Even though nominations of that time did not specify criteria, his contributions are mentioned in the Old Crescent nomination. Therefore, staff concurs with all the criteria cited, and recommends approval for the State and National Registers.

6. Patoka Bridges Historic District, CR 300W from the Gibson-Pike County line and Bridge #246 over the Patoka River South Fork to the northern abutment of Bridge #81 over Houchins Ditch, Oakland City vic., Pike County (1803)

This district was identified as part of a staff site visit to the Patoka Bottoms region. While the staff did not identify a broader rural historic district, they do feel that these two bridges and the Old State Road between them illustrate the transportation heritage of a locally significant crossing. The application claims Criterion C for the engineering significance of the two metal bridges and satisfactorily justifies that claim. While neither bridge was present prior to the Civil War, the applicant cites documentation to explain the early transportation / Underground Railroad significance of the site. As a result, Engineering, Transportation, Social History and Ethnic Heritage have been listed as areas of significance under relevant Criteria A and C. The staff recommends approval for the State and National Register under these criteria.

7. Twelve Points Historic District, 167-628-24001-24026, Lafayette Ave from Linden to 13th St & Maple Ave from Garfield to 13th St., Terre Haute, Vigo County (1804)

Identified in the 1983 Vigo County Interim Report, Twelve Points is a satellite commercial district to downtown Terre Haute. In fact, its significance historically is that it was the first large scale suburban commercial development in Terre Haute. The application also documents the architectural significance of the district, and traces the development of indigenous commercial buildings of the 20th century both locally and regionally. The staff recommends approval for the State and National Registers, local significance.

8. Dr. Christopher Souder House, 183-510-16028, 214 W. Main Street, Larwill, Whitley County (1809)

The Souder House was rated "outstanding" in the 2002 Whitley County Interim Report. The consultant provides a context only for Criterion C, for the architectural significance of the house. As an example of Italianate residential design, the house is the best in town, and among the better examples in the county. The staff recommends approval under Criterion C for the State and National Registers at local significance.

TO: Members of the Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board

FROM: Jon Smith, Director, Division of Historic Preservation & Archaeology

DATE: January 19, 2005

SUBJECT: Addendum to staff comments for items on the January 26, 2005, Agenda

II. State Certificates of Approval

1. Request by the Indiana Department of Natural Resources, Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites for a certificate of approval to alter the Sowers Bank Barn at the Gene Stratton Porter State Historic Site, Noble County, Indiana.

The January 5, 2005, staff comments for this agenda item had indicated, "this agenda item, if necessary, will be mailed separately." However, the packet mailed to Review Board members containing those comments did include Attachment II-1, which consists of Kathleen McLary's December 15, 2005, cover letter to Jon C. Smith and the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites' certificate of approval application.

The DHPA staff has concluded that the Sowers Bank Barn is not a historic structure, within the meaning of IC 14-21-1-18(a) and (b), and, therefore, that a certificate of approval is *not* required for the state-funded alteration of the bank barn.

At the time that the January 5 staff comments were mailed, the DHPA staff was attempting to obtain further information about the Sowers Farmhouse, on the possibility that the house and bank barn might constitute a register-eligible farm or farmstead. According to Item 4 of the certificate of approval application, the house and barn are apparently the only structures on the Sowers Farm. The Sowers Farm apparently adjoins the Gene Stratton Porter State Historic Site, but until 2000 it was not owned by the State of Indiana. The Gene Stratton Porter State Memorial, as it was then called, was listed in the National Register of Historic Places on June 27, 1974. However, the nomination indicates that only a 1.2-acre parcel, containing the Cabin in Wildflower Woods (the Gene Stratton Porter house) was included in the nomination.

Unless a barn is very unusual in its design (such as a round barn) or possesses some specific historical significance, the Review Board and the DHPA staff have tended not to consider a barn by itself to be eligible for the National Register or the Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures. The Sowers Bank Barn appears to be an attractive example of its type, but the staff does not think that its significance rises to the level of register eligibility.

Historic farms or farmsteads typically include a significant house and significant barns or other outbuildings, but almost always they consist of more than two structures, unlike the Sowers Farm. Moreover, the photographs of the Sowers Farmhouse (Attachment II-1-A, submitted on January 12, 2005, by Laura Minzes of the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites) indicate the farmhouse is not an especially good example of any particular style or of a northeastern Indiana farmhouse. The farmhouse does have some interesting woodwork and features, most notably the pocket doors. However, the exterior of the house is problematic. The basic massing of the two-story part of the house appears to be Italianate, which is curious since the house is said to have been built in 1904, well after the Italianate style had passed its peak of popularity in Indiana. Another unusual (but not architecturally noteworthy) feature is that there doesn't seem to be a formal front entry. The DHPA

staff speculates that there may have been originally a main entrance on the south façade of the two-story part of the house, which would have been eliminated with the later addition of the one-and-one-half story, gable-end wing, which appears to have an informal entryway facing west. Consequently, the farmhouse may have a significant integrity problem.

Ms. Minzes indicated to John Carr of the DHPA staff that the only known connection of Gene Stratton Porter to the Sowers Farmhouse is that she stayed there while the Cabin in Wildflower Woods was being constructed. However, the DHPA staff does not consider that connection strong enough to make either the farmhouse or the bank barn eligible for the Indiana Register or the National Register. Consequently, the Sowers Bank Barn does not appear to be a "historic structure," within the meaning of IC 14-21-1-18(a) and (b).

Since no historic site or historic structure would be altered in the course of this state-funded alteration of the Sowers Bank Barn, the certificate of approval requirement of IC 14-21-1-18(a) and (b) is inapplicable. Consequently, the staff recommends that the Review Board consider the certificate of approval application to be withdrawn.

III. Stabilization of the Posey House at the Corydon Capitol State Historic Site, Harrison County, Indiana

As the January 5, 2005, staff comments for this agenda item stated, a representative of the Department of Natural Resources, Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites, will report on this activity at the January 26, 2005, Review Board meeting.

Since those staff comment were mailed, the DHPA staff on January 14, 2005, received from Laura Minzes of the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites labeled photographs of the "Posey House Emergency Stabilization 2004," included here as Attachment III-A..

On October 13, 2004, Ms. Minzes, via e-mail, notified Jon Smith of the Division of Historic Preservation and Archaeology regarding the situation at the Posey House at the Corydon Capitol State Historic Site. She indicated that she and Kathleen McLary had visited the house on September 24, 2004, and that the Sites Restoration Crew was at Corydon on October 13, starting some work on the Posey House. She reported that the brick rear of the building was shifting away from the house even further than before, causing further cracking. She and Orbin Ash discussed the Certificate of Approval our division received in October 2003 for the building and those parameters set therein. They concluded that there is some, perhaps substantial, emergency stabilization that needed to take place, especially regarding the rear wall and the southwest addition. They expressed the intention to do the minimum necessary but, at that point, they were not yet sure what would be involved and acknowledged that it could involve some removal. Ms. Minzes also indicated that they thought the problems might be identified within the next two to three weeks, but they realized that would be too late to report at the October 2004 Review Board meeting. Consequently, they expressed their intention to report on the emergency to the Review Board at the January 2005 meeting.

Attachment III-B is a copy of the "Guidelines for Emergency Action Using State Funds," which the Review Board adopted on April 17, 2002, to deal with situations, such as that of the Posey House, in which action must be taken to protect people or property before a certificate of approval could be obtained from the Review Board. The DHPA staff believes that the guidelines apply to the Posey House situation and that the Division of Indiana State Museums and Historic Sites has complied so far with subsections B(1) and (4) of the guidelines and intends to comply with the other provisions of the guidelines. The staff has no further comment at this time.